

international

nursing

consultancy

practice

priorities



Salford Centre for Nursing,
Midwifery & Collaborative Research

THE PROS AND CONS OF MULTI-PROFESSIONAL WORK BASED LEARNING

Joan Livesley
University of Salford



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Paula Ormandy, Karen Holland,
Michelle Howarth, Joan Livesley
and

Lis Mars

Patricia Cotton

Margaret Perry



EVALUATION OF WORK BASED LEARNING (EBP)

- BACKGROUND
- RESEARCH AND EVIDENCE BASED PRACTICE MODULE
- CRITICAL APPRAISAL WORKSHOPS
- EVALUATION DESIGN - TRIANGULATION
- PRE COURSE ANALYSIS
- POST COURSE ANALYSIS
- CONCLUSIONS
- RECOMMENDATIONS



BACKGROUND

- Annual training Needs Analysis

Need to develop understanding of concept of evidence based practice

1. Need to raise awareness of research and evidence based practice
2. Need to develop skills of locating, appraising and implementing evidence (clinical effectiveness)
3. Need to develop critical appraisal skills

Pilot evaluation instrument



BACKGROUND

Previous experience (work based learning projects in partnerships with NHS Trusts)

- Critical Appraisal Trainers (CASP)
- Research Fellow
(Health Care Practice Research and Development Unit)



RESEARCH AND EVIDENCE BASED PRACTICE MODULE

To encourage awareness of EBP and explore the value and application of evidence to practice

- research process
- research designs
- ethical issues
- critical appraisal
- influence of evidence on practice (clinical decision making)



EBP and Research Awareness Module Format

- 6 Month work based programme
 - 1 half day preparation for programme
 - 6 lecturer facilitated study days

NOT CREDIT RATED

Portfolio - Reflective work based exercises
- Evidence of learning

- Evidence Based Action Plan (Poster)



Critical Appraisal Workshop Format

INDIVIDUAL DAYS - (CASP Programme)

- Develop awareness of Critical Appraisal in context of EBP
- Facilitate Critical Appraisal skills development through application of appraisal frameworks
- Encourage continued development of skills through CPD and journal clubs
- Facilitate a questioning culture through which capability and initiative are developed



COLLABORATION IN HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE

- National, Political and Higher Education agenda for multi-professional education, work Based Learning and Evidence Based Practice



Work Based Learning

- Learning for work
 - Learning at work
 - Reviewing and learning from work experiences
 - Live projects
 - Learning to learn
-
- Gray D (2001)



COLLABORATION IN HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE

Shared learning...

... When two or more professions learn from and about each other to improve collaboration and the quality of care..."

(CAIPE 1997)



Collaboration

- *"...Working within the spirit of collaboration underpins all partnership working..."*
(DES 2003)
- *"...Learning partnerships epitomise this new way of working and successful partnerships are at the leading edge, facilitating the delivery of enhanced services through the business of collaboration..."*
(DES 2003)



EVALUATING PROGRAMME

- To measure the effectiveness of education programmes and measure the research capability building
- TOOLS
 - Pre - Post Test Quantitative/Qualitative Questionnaires
 1. Participant perception of research and organisational culture
 2. Self assessment of research skills and knowledge
 3. Thematic analysis of participants qualitative evaluation (Critical Appraisal Workshops)



EVALUATION PROJECT

Represents multi-professional perceptions of
EBP and Research skills and organisational
culture across 1 Trust



DEMOGRAPHICS

- 64 Participants [9 Directorates]
(2 missing data)
- 33 Nurses [8 Directorates]
- 7 Physiotherapists [4 Directorates]
- 2 Occupational Ther [1 Directorate]
- 3 Midwives [1 Directorate]
- 3 Radiographers [1 Directorate]
- 2 Health Visitors [1 Directorate]
- 5 School Health Adv [1 Directorate]
- 6 Managers [1 Directorate]
- 1 ODP [1 Directorate]



DIRECTORATES (9)

- Women and Children - 14
- Community - 11
- Psychiatry - 11
- Nursing, Quality, Ed and Training - 7
- Medical - 7
- Recovery/Theatres - 5
- Radiology - 3
- Surgical - 3
- Occupational H and S - 1
- TOTAL - 62



Utilisation of Available Information Sources

| Resource | Pre % use | Post % use |
|----------------------------|-----------|------------|
| Trust Library | 77.3 | 100 |
| CINAHL / Medline databases | 45.5 | 90.9 |
| Cochrane database | 31.8 | 86.4 |
| Ward/Dept Journals | 68.2 | 77.3 |
| Personal subs. Journals | 68.2 | 72.1 |
| Trust R&D facilitator | 4.5 | 27.3 |
| Regional R&D Forums | 22.7 | 27.3 |



PRIOR INVOLVEMENT IN RESEARCH

- 28 (44%) previous research course
- 24 (38%) previous involvement in research activity
 - 11 assisted other member of staff
 - 9 research participant
 - 9 part of course
 - 7 assisted medical staff
 - 5 member of steering group
 - 5 facilitator of research study
 - 4 own research study
 - 4 part of research team
 - 2 participants had previously published work



Question 1 - ATTENDANCE (6 missing data)

- 59.6% Chose to attend
- 19.3% Told to attend with choice
- 21.1% Told to attend no choice

- 40% had managers who identified module and/or workshop as valuable to practitioners



PERCEPTIONS OF RESEARCH (no missing data)

8 questions - 5 point Likert scale

1 = strongly agree 5 = strongly disagree

3 Don't Know

Responses 1 + 2 and 4 + 5 combined for analysis



PERCEPTIONS OF RESEARCH (PRE)

| STATEMENT | STRONGLY AGREE/ SOMEWHAT AGREE | STRONGLY DISAGREE/ SOMEWHAT DISAGREE |
|--|---|---|
| Research findings have little impact on H.P | | 76.6% n=49 |
| One essential role for a practitioner is to carry out research | 84.4% n=54 | |
| Most Practitioners are competent to undertake research | 50.0% n=32 | 42.2% n=27 |



PERCEPTIONS OF RESEARCH (PRE)

| STATEMENT | STRONGLY AGREE/ SOMEWHAT AGREE | STRONGLY DISAGREE/ SOMEWHAT DISAGREE |
|--|---|---|
| Managers attitudes do not permit the implementation of research | 40.6 | 51.6 |
| All H.P should do compulsory research methodology course | 73.4 | |
| Lack of time for research is not excuse for a motivated practitioner | 62.5 | |



OPPOSITE DESCRIPTORS Research (mean score analysis)

- important
- interesting
- time consuming
- cost effective
- difficult
- relevant
- decision aiding
- hard work



PERCEPTIONS OF ORGANISATIONAL CULTURE

19 Opposite descriptive statements on 10 point scale

0 = low 10 = high

Mean score analysis clustered at 4 - 6 for 15 statements

Highest scores

- 6.88 high regard for individuals and patient centred care
- 6.38 excellent opportunities for CPD
- 6.25 Effective team work

Lowest score

- 3.87 absence of external audit



BARRIERS TO IMPLEMENTING CHANGE

- Workload pressure 21
- Lack of authority 18
- Time constraints 17
- Negative attitude of colleagues 17
- Resistant culture 16
- Managers' attitudes 7
- Lack of motivation 4



Differences in Participants Knowledge Level Post Research and EBP Module 1 and 2 (n = 22)

| Level of Knowledge Skill / Activity | +++ % |
|--|------------------|
| Strategies to implement evidence into practice | 90 |
| Understanding research language | 85 |
| Literature Searching | 85 |
| Critical Appraisal of quantitative research | 80 |
| Data collection tools and techniques | 80 |
| Using a Database | 76 |
| Critical Appraisal of qualitative research | 76 |
| Analysing quantitative data | 75 |
| Analysing qualitative data | 75 |
| Dissemination strategies | 70 |



Differences in Participants Knowledge Level

Post EBP and Research awareness Module 1 and 2 (n = 22)

| Level of Knowledge Skill / Activity | --- % |
|--------------------------------------|----------|
| Accessing the internet | 30 |
| Statistics | 20 |
| Project management | 15 |
| Data collection tools and techniques | 15 |
| Using a Library | 10 |
| Analysing quantitative data | 10 |
| Analysing qualitative data | 10 |



LEVEL OF KNOWLEDGE/SKILL QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

- locating literature and evidence
 - "...found searching the literature very valuable, but time consuming..."
 - "...Much more confident staff in the library very helpful, more competent in computer use..."
- evaluating research
 - "...Now feel able to pull out relevant literature from an article and can now systematically read an article..."
 - "...Found it difficult to appraise articles so will enrol on a one day workshop to develop my confidence and experience..."



QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

- research design and questions

"... This course has encouraged me to look at the aims, objectives and a question for a research study..."

"...I feel I know how to formulate a research proposal and understand how to find information..."

- implementing evidence

"...I would now feel confident in trying to implement evidence into practice and is something I would like to undertake with my action plan..."

"... Would feel happier about trying to implement evidence into practice due to this course..."



QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

- gaps in knowledge

"...No experience of completing a funding application, don't know where research funding is available..."

"...Never written a research study ...or been published..."

"...Need support with managing a research project, feel confident in own ability provided support is available and I know where to access this support..."

"...Not confident with statistical analysis..."



QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

- impact on practice

"...From having no confidence or prior knowledge of research I feel I have learnt so much in a supportive and friendly atmosphere. I am now confident to 'take it on'..."

"...The course has been very useful in providing a basic understanding but need to continue now with using these skills to develop this..."

"...It has given me far more confidence in my own abilities..."

"...I will be displaying my research findings in the poster we developed in my work place..."



QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

- barriers to and strategies for implementation
- "...biggest handicap in one or two areas is negativity from a small number of senior team leaders..."*
- "...decided to gain their involvement in a small aspect of the work initially..."*
- "...I would use research to bring about change within a culture heavily steeped in tradition..."*



CHANGES IN PERCEPTION

| STATEMENT | PRE MODULE | POST MODULE |
|---|---|---|
| | STRONGLY DISAGREE/ SOMEWHAT DISAGREE | STRONGLY DISAGREE/ SOMEWHAT DISAGREE |
| Research findings have little impact on H.P.'s | 45% | 64% |
| H.P.'s are not interested in implementing research findings | 64% | 45% |



CHANGES IN PERCEPTION

| STATEMENT | PRE COURSE | POST COURSE | % INCREASE |
|--|---|---|------------|
| | STRONGLY AGREE/ SOMEWHAT AGREE | STRONGLY AGREE/ SOMEWHAT AGREE | |
| One essential role for a practitioner is to carry out research | 82% | 95% | 13% |

"...Research has proved to be one of the good guys..."



Thematic analysis of participants' evaluations of critical appraisal workshops

Teaching and Learning

"...Excellent facilitators made it interesting and inspirational. Explained it well very, good teachers..."

I enjoyed the group work and actually appraising the articles..."

"...Before the course I thought it would be boring but I have found it to be interesting, valuable and thought provoking..."



Thematic Analysis of participants' evaluations of critical appraisal workshops

- **Multi-professional shared training**

"...I enjoyed the multi-disciplinary approach and input and feedback with other agencies..."

- **Greater understanding of terminology**

"...Encouraged me to read more than the aims and the conclusions to a paper..."

"...Understanding of qualitative and quantitative terms plus other new terminology..."



Thematic analysis of participants' evaluations of critical appraisal workshops

Constructive feedback

- A lot to get through
- Prefer two day course and follow up in six months
- Too much side tracking - although this was good
- Needed more on qualitative work



WORK BASED PROJECTS

- O.T and Physio - TENS
- Children's ward manager-dishwasher
- Physio - assessment tool
- Primary Care Nurse - ICP (cystic fibrosis)
- Forensic Learning Disability Nurses - clinical supervision; debriefing; assessment tools
- Radiographer - Mammography practice
- School Health Advisor - audit head lice interventions



CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- Continue to provide multi-professional research awareness and critical appraisal programmes
- Institute ward specific research awareness training - to create culture change
- Introduce and develop Journal Clubs



CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- Institute additional training initiatives to develop research interest and promote dissemination of good practice
 - Project management
 - Writing for publication
 - Gaining ethical approval
- Institute work-based research projects guided by an experienced researcher working alongside a practitioner in practice



CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

"...Health care practitioners need to be socialised to think about research..."

(Clarke and Sleep 1991)

"... *The integration of research into practice has to be addressed at all levels within the organisation, from policy statements, procedure manuals and from managers, educators and clinicians to support workers within the framework of the management of change...*"

(MacGuire 1990)